



November 13, 2023

County of Middlesex
399 Ridout Street North
London, Ontario
N6A 2P1

Attention: Mr. Chris Traini, P.Eng.
County Engineer

Nairn Bridge Over Ausable River
Project Number M-K-23

Dear Mr. Traini:

A total of six (6) tenders were received for this project on November 8, 2023 through the Bids & Tenders Bidding System. The tenders are listed below in ascending order and include the \$250,000 Contingency Allowance and 13% HST.

| Tenderer | Submitted Price | Submitted Price Compared to Low Bidder |
|---|-----------------|--|
| KB Civil Constructors Inc. | \$4,055,703.60 | - |
| Looby Builders (Dublin) Limited | \$4,109,596.97 | +1.3% |
| McLean Taylor Construction Limited | \$4,399,167.79 | +8.5% |
| Clearwater Structures Inc. | \$4,588,605.69 | +13.1% |
| Urbanlink Civil Ltd. | \$4,812,105.00 | +18.7% |
| GIP Construction and Materials Limited (Formerly Aecon Construction and Materials Limited) | \$6,171,117.35 | +52.2% |

Dillon's pre-tender estimate for this contract was \$4,868,419.68. The higher pre-tender estimate compared to the average low three tenders is primarily attributed to higher unit prices used for structural items, based industry data from recent construction contracts in the area for both provincial and municipal contracts.

Addenda: All six Tenderers acknowledged receipt of three (3) Addenda.

Tender Prices: The low three tenders were checked for unbalanced prices, and also compared with our estimate of probable project cost. Recognizing the usual variation in unit prices between different Tenderers, the prices in each tender are generally considered realistic given the nature of the work.

51 Breithaupt Street
Suite 200
Kitchener, Ontario
Canada
N2H 5G5
Telephone
519.571.9833
Fax
519.571.7424



Ability and Experience: A review of past experience was completed for the low bidder (KB Civil Constructors Inc.) and second low bidder (Looby Builders (Dublin) Limited).

KB Civil Constructors Inc. (KB Civil), from North York, ON, was established in 2015 as a start-up and has completed projects in residential building renovations and civil services, based on information from KB Civil's website. Submitted reference project experience by KB Civil for this tender includes work that is significantly smaller in size and scope compared to the work required for this contract. Reference project work includes rehabilitation of bridge elements, such as barrier replacement, expansion joint replacement, installation of deck drains, and patch-waterproof-pave of a bridge deck. One of the three submitted reference projects shows KB Civil as a general contractor and the remaining projects as a subcontractor. None of the submitted reference projects include full bridge removal, construction of a new bridge, superstructure replacement, or construction of deep foundations. Based on our review of KB Civil's experience, KB Civil has not demonstrated they are "skilled and regularly engaged in work of a character similar to that covered by the Drawings and Specifications" as required in Section 1.16 of the tender document. As such, it is recommended that KB Civil's bid is disqualified.

Looby Builders (Dublin) Limited (Looby), from Stratford, ON, has completed several projects of similar size and scope, and have demonstrated they are "skilled and regularly engaged in work of a character similar to that covered by the Drawings and Specifications". A bridge experience summary list is attached.

Recommendation: We consider Looby is adequately experienced and capable of constructing this contract, and we recommend that the County accept their tender for the price of \$4,109,596.97, and award Nairn Bridge Over Ausable River, contract M-K-23, to Looby.

Sincerely,

DILLON CONSULTING LIMITED

Brent Visscher, P.Eng.
Project Manager

BTV:nek
Enclosure(s)

Our file: 21-2363



Experience (Looby)

| Location | Owner | Project | Date Completed |
|-------------|----------------------------------|---|----------------|
| Ottawa, ON | City of Ottawa | Strandherd Drive Bridge Replacement Three-span box girder bridge replacement over the VIA railway in Ottawa. | 2022 |
| Elora, ON | County of Wellington | Badley Bridge Replacement Three-span bridge replacement over the Grand River. | 2021 |
| Wingham, ON | Municipality of Morris-Turnberry | Blind Line Bridge Replacement Two span bridge replacement over Little Maitland River. | 2022 |